

Research Integrity Officer Boot Camp

July 23-25, 2024

**Campus of Colorado School of Mines
Golden, Colorado USA**

Goals and Objectives

The RIO Boot Camp will provide a forum for RIOs and their legal counsel to discuss critical skills that RIOs need to fulfill their responsibilities and successfully navigate the most important problems facing RIOs today. Through use of case studies, the Boot Camp will illustrate best practices needed to manage research misconduct cases and handle the major challenges they present. Finally, the critical role that obtaining, analyzing, and interpreting evidence plays in directing investigations will be illustrated through descriptions of forensic techniques used by ORI to detect fabricated or falsified images and numbers. By the end of the Boot Camp, all participants will gain experience in handling simulated allegations of misconduct and will be able to critique strengths and weaknesses of their own and alternative approaches.

Office of Research Integrity (ORI), HHS Co-Sponsor:

Ivie Conlon, Ph.D., Scientist-Investigator, DIO, ORI
Ning Du, M.D., Ph.D., Scientist-Investigator, DIO, ORI
Sheila Garrity, JD, MPH, MBA, Director, ORI
Patricia Mantoan, JD, Office of General Counsel, ORI

Colorado School of Mines, Institutional Co-Sponsor:

Scot Allen, Ph.D., Director, Research Integrity and Security and RIO
Erin McCaffrey, MLIS, Senior Research Integrity and Security Analyst and Associate RIO

Teaching RIOs:

Mary Ann Allen, Ph.D., Faculty Director, Responsible and Ethical Conduct of Research Education Program, University of Colorado Boulder
Scot Allen, Ph.D., Director, Research Integrity and Security, RIO, Colorado School of Mines
Erin McCaffrey, MLIS, Senior Research Integrity and Security Analyst, Associate RIO, Colorado School of Mines
Linda Schutjer, JD, Senior Legal Counsel, Colorado State University

Guest speakers:

Bijan Charles Bewley, JD, Assistant Counsel, University of Colorado Boulder, Office of University Counsel
John O'Loughlin, Ph.D., Chair, Standing Committee on Research Misconduct, University of Colorado Boulder
Candace Ramsey, MBA MSSE ISSM, Senior Director of Research IT, Strategy & Operations, Information System Security Manager, Office of the Vice President for Research, Colorado State University

Aliza Sacknovitz, Deputy Director, Research Integrity and Administrative Investigations
Division, Office of Inspector General, National Science Foundation
Alison Antes Schuelke, Associate Professor of Medicine, Division of General Medical Sciences,
Department of Medicine, School of Medicine, Washington University
Anne Silverman, Ph.D., Rowlinson Associate Professor of Mechanical Engineering, Colorado
School of Mines

RIO Bootcamp Session Objectives

Session Title Objectives—By the end of this session, the learner will be able to...

- Role of the RIO (and others)
 - Determine at which phases to involve different members of the “RIO team”;
 - Identify key resources and procedures for consistent research misconduct proceedings; and
 - Discuss the scope of the RIO’s role and understand the role of other players such as the DO, GC, Respondent, Complainant.

The Role of ORI

- Understand the role of ORI, the resources available with ORI and when to reach out.

Allegation and Assessment

- Define an allegation;
- Define RM and FFP;
- Understand how to triage allegations; and
- Conduct a preliminary assessment in accordance with PHS Regulations.

Identification & Sequestration of Evidence

- Understand how to plan for effective data sequestration, both virtually and in-person;
- Identify barriers to successful data sequestration; and
- Determine relevancy of evidence.

Inquiry Overview & Notice to the Respondent

- Understand when an inquiry is warranted;
- Outline the steps to take before and during an inquiry;
- Understand how to notice Respondent(s);
- Define “need to know” “confidentiality” and the steps that are required before and during a notice; and

- Draft a notice of inquiry.

Examine Evidence & Identifying Subject Matter Experts (SME)

- Define vetting procedures to identify SMEs;
- Discuss different models for the Inquiry phase (RIO, Inquiry Official, Inquiry Committee); and
- Explain how to examine or train SMEs to examine evidence.

Determining if an Investigation is Warranted

- Understand how to determine if an investigation is warranted;
- Understand required notifications if warranted and how to close the matter if not; and
- The role of the Deciding Official.

Investigation Overview

- Explain the transition from Inquiry to Investigation; and
- Understand high-level overview of investigation procedures and resources.

Identifying and Impaneling Committees

- Discuss the different levels of expertise for an Inquiry Official vs an Investigation Committee;
- Charge the Committee, NDAs, Copy of Policy: and
- Understand how to handle difficulty finding and objections to committee members.

Assisting and Supporting Committees:

- Understand the role of the RIO in supporting and assisting committees including with interviews, examining evidence and logistics; and
- Understand the role of the committee and their responsibilities.

Handling Admissions

- Define admission;
- Know when to report an admission to ORI; and
- Know when an admission can and cannot replace a committee finding.

Investigation Outcomes

- Discuss possible outcomes based on a preponderance of the evidence;
- Exemplify how to assess intent; and
- Understand how to determine corrective/administrative actions and necessary referrals.

Report Drafting and Finalizing

- Know best practices for report writing;
- Understand the scope of various report and memorandum throughout the process;
- Understand the role of the RIO and Committee in report writing; and
- Discuss procedures for report drafting and finalization.

Afterwards

- Retractions, Rumors and Students
- Protect or restore the reputation of people – 42 CFR §93.304 (k) (l)

Agenda
RIO Boot Camp -- July 23 to July 25
Green Center, Colorado School of Mines

Tuesday, July 23

Morning Session: *Welcome and Overview*

Metals Hall

- 7:30 - 8:30 Continental Breakfast - Locate Group Assignments
- 8:30 - 8:45 Welcome - Mike Kaufman, Ph.D., Director of Materials and Energy Initiatives, Colorado School of Mines
- 8:45 - 9:30 Introductions & Bootcamp Overview – Scot Allen and Erin McCaffrey
- 9:30 - 9:45 Break
- 9:45 - 10:30 The Role of the RIO - Scot Allen
- 10:30 - 11:00 The Role of ORI - Sheila Garrity and Ning Du
- 11:00 - 11:30 Q&A with ORI - Sheila Garrity and Ning Du
- 11:30 - 12:00 Case Study: Role of the RIO
- 12:00 - 1:00 Lunch - *Friedhoff Hall*

Afternoon Session: *Allegation and Assessment*

Metals Hall

- 1:00 - 2:00 Allegation and Assessment - Scot Allen and Anne Silverman
- 2:00 - 2:45 Case Study: Allegation and Assessment
- 2:45 - 3:00 Break
- 3:00 - 4:00 Identification & Sequestration of Evidence - Linda Schutjer and Candace Ramsey (virtual)
- 4:00 - 4:45 Case Study: Identification and Sequestration of Evidence
- 4:45 - 5:00 Recap Day 1/Assessment/Feedback - Mary Ann Allen
- 5:30 - 7:30 Networking Reception, *Mines Museum*

Wednesday, July 24

Morning Session: *Inquiry*

Metals Hall

- 7:30 - 8:30 Continental Breakfast - Locate Group Assignments

7/17/24

8:30 - 9:30 Inquiry Overview & Notice to the Respondent - Scot Allen and John O'Loughlin (virtual)

9:30 - 10:00 Examining Evidence & Identifying SMEs - Erin McCaffrey

10:00 - 10:15 Break

10:15 - 11:15 Determining if an Investigation is Warranted - Bijan Bewley, Assistant Counsel, CU Boulder

11:15 - 12:00 Case Study: Transition from Inquiry to Investigation

12:00 - 1:00 Lunch – *Friedhoff Hall*

Afternoon Session: *Investigations
Metals Hall*

1:00 - 1:45 Perspectives on Evidence - Patricia Mantoan

1:45 - 2:45 Investigation Overview & Impaneling Committees - Linda Schutjer

2:45 - 3:00 Break

3:00 - 4:00 Assisting and Supporting Committees - Mary Ann Allen

4:00 - 4:45 Case Study: Investigation Overview and Impaneling Committees

4:45 - 5:00 Day 2 Recap/Assessment/Feedback - Erin McCaffrey

Thursday, July 25

Morning Session: *Everything Else
Metals Hall*

7:30 - 8:00 Continental Breakfast (No group assignments today)

8:00 - 8:45 Investigation Outcomes - Alison Antes Schuelke (virtual) and Aliza Sacknovitz (virtual)

8:45 - 9:15 Role of NSF - Aliza Sacknovitz (virtual)

9:15 - 10:15 Report Drafting and Finalizing - Scot Allen and Erin McCaffrey

10:15 - 10:30 Break

10:30 - 1:15 Afterward: Retractions, Rumors and Students - Linda Schutjer

11:15 - 12:00 Discussion and Wrap Up - Mary Ann Allen and Scot Allen

*Box lunches available to grab and go as we end